



A systematic review of intervention studies using Health Action Process Approach (HAPA) model components: effects on weight loss

Nikki Murray¹, <u>Jane Smith¹</u>, Colin Greaves¹, Lee Hooper², Charles Abraham¹

1 Psychology Applied to Health Group, University of Exeter Medical School, Exeter, UK; 2 Norwich Medical School, University of East Anglia, Norwich, UK

Introduction

Characteristics of weight loss trials (n=7)

The HAPA model¹ (Fig 1) and HAPA-like approaches including multiple motivational and volitional components to support behaviour change are increasingly applied in intervention studies.

Review questions

This review:

- . Describes how HAPA-based approaches have been used to design and evaluate interventions to change behaviours for preventing or managing chronic disease;
- 2. Examines their effectiveness, with analyses here focussing on weight-related outcomes.



Fig 2 Studies selected for inclusion and analysis



- Though interventions were HAPA-like none directly referenced the HAPA model.
- None included all 6 HAPA components but all but 1 included 5 components.
- As well as self-efficacy, all included outcome expectancies, intention formation (e.g. goal setting), action planning and other self-regulation strategies (e.g. self-monitoring), and all but one included coping planning. None addressed risk perceptions.
- 2 focussed on chronic disease management (1 diabetes, 1 various), others prevention in at-risk.
- 4 studies involved group sessions, 3 individual contacts and 3 web-based delivery (3 mixed), most with initial weekly contacts, then follow up contacts for between up to 2 and 18 months.
- Follow up ranged from 6m to 36m.
- Risk of bias was highest in relation to allocation concealment and incomplete outcome data, with no

Inclusion criteria

Type: Full publication in English >1992 **Population:** Adults (16+) **Intervention:**

• Development / design or evaluation is: HAPA-based: mentions/ref. HAPA as basis OR HAPA-like: as per Fig 1 includes self-efficacy plus 4 of 6 other defined HAPA components, at least 1 motivational (1-3) and 1 volitional (4-6). • Targets on-going (not once off) behaviour. And for this **analysis focussing on weight loss: Intervention:** Targets physical activity AND diet to promote weight loss. **Comparator:** Usual care/minimal intervention **Outcome:** Comparative data on weight. Study design: Controlled trial.

inadequate data (1)

7 trials reporting appropriate data included in meta-analysis

Fig 3 Countries in which trials conducted (n=54)



Fig 4 Behaviour targets & outcomes in trials (n=54) 50 45 Target Outcome 35 30

suggestions of selective outcome reporting.

Fig 6 Effects on weight loss up to 6m & 12m (n=7)

	HAPA intervention			Control				Mean Difference	Mean Difference
Study or Subgroup	Mean	SD	Total	Mean	SD	Total	Weight	IV, Random, 95% CI	IV, Random, 95% CI
1.6.1 6 months or less	S								
53	-1.84	7.14	29	-0.6	3.73	16	7.0%	-1.24 [-4.42, 1.94]	
25	-2.04	0.54	31	1.13	0.59	31	18.6%	-3.17 [-3.45, -2.89]	+
1770	-5.8	5.8	241	-1.1	3.2	241	16.8%	-4.70 [-5.54, -3.86]	
1637	-2.58	3.91	32	-1.18	4.21	21	10.1%	-1.40 [-3.65, 0.85]	
Subtotal (95% CI)			333			309	52.5%	-3.15 [-4.42, -1.88]	◆
Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 1.09; Chi ² = 15.92, df = 3 (P = 0.001); l ² = 81%									
Test for overall effect: Z = 4.86 (P < 0.00001)									
1.6.2 12 months									
35	-3.5	4.96	148	-0.78	3.83	157	16.1%	-2.72 [-3.72, -1.72]	
348	-6.03	5.06	115	-1.44	4.16	93	14.9%	-4.59 [-5.84, -3.34]	
1543	-0.9	4.57	153	-0.2	3.29	155	16.6%	-0.70 [-1.59, 0.19]	
Subtotal (95% CI)			416			405	47.5%	-2.63 [-4.79, -0.48]	
Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 3.33; Chi ² = 25.89, df = 2 (P < 0.00001); I ² = 92%									
Test for overall effect: Z = 2.40 (P = 0.02)									
Total (95% CI)			749			714	100.0%	-2.84 [-3.90, -1.79]	◆
Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 1.54; Chi ² = 51.70, df = 6 (P < 0.00001); I ² = 88%									
Test for overall effect: Z = 5.28 (P < 0.00001)									
Test for subgroup differences: Chi ² = 0.16, df = 1 (P = 0.69), l ² = 0%									

Conclusions

- Of the growing number of trials of HAPA-based and HAPA-like interventions identified, most targeted physical activity, diet and weight loss.
- HAPA-like interventions resulted in statistically and clinically significant weight loss of 3.15kg up to 6m

Methods

Relevant studies identified through bibliographic database and citation searching, author contacts and reference lists were selected, categorised and synthesised as per our protocol: http://www.crd.york.ac.uk/PROSPERO/ display_record.asp?ID=CRD42013003596



(p<0.001) and 2.63kg at 12m (p=0.02). • Despite including many previously identified effective techniques and targets for weight loss interventions² this is comparable to typical weight loss reported in a previous review of reviews³, and resulting from commercial programmes⁴. • Significant heterogeneity across studies is being further explored and analyses of other outcomes (e.g. physical activity) in this review is ongoing.

References

. Schwarzer R. The Health Action Process Approach (HAPA). URL: http://www.hapamodel.de/ (Accessed 28/11/14). 2. Dombrowski et al. *Health Psychol Rev 2012*;6(1):7-32.

- 3. Greaves et al. BMC Public Health 2011; 11:119.

4. Jolly K et al. *BMJ* 2011;**343**:d6500.

Acknowledgments

Thanks to Prof Ralf Schwarzer for his invaluable advice and Kelly Blockley for her early work on the review.